SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : I was trying to do it yesterday. Please liien to me for a minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes. I will listen to you.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: Give me a minute.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : Madam,... *{.Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He says that there is a privilege notice against the Member. Let me hear *it. .(Interruptions)..*

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Give me a minute. Listen to me. Both yesterday and today, the hon, lady Member has made a very serious and grave allegations gainst the Minister, his intention and the intention of his Ministry in totality to cover up the entire thing. That is fine. Yesterday I had pointed out that she could only do so if she let us kno.v the mother-document first; otherwise she would be impinging upon our right. She has quoted it again, and she has no right to do it until the mother document is made available to us by her duly authenticated with your authority. Therefore, it impinges upon our right ... *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There it no privilege in it.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : महोदया, अगर आप मुझे अनुमति दें तो मदर-डाक्यूमेंट.....(व्यवधान) . . . .मैं अथेंटीकेट करके दोनों के दोनों मदर डाक्यूमेंट ..... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am allowing ne'ther the mother-document nor the father-document to be laid on the Table of the House. No, no not possible.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): But quotation is allowed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : About the privilege issue, I have dealt w.th it.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : That is over. I am on a different point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The privilege matter is over.

RE: SUGAR SEAM-REPORT AND REVISED ATR

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam I am on a different matter. Yesterday, the Finance Minister placed on the Table of the House what he considered a revised ATR That revised ATR which he laid on the Table of the House was in blatant breach of the covenant we all entered into during the last session.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Today we don't have the Zero Hour. Why aro you asking about this?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: An assurance was given to the House, through the Chair. ... *(Interruptions)* ... Madam, the matter needs to be taken up. The revised ATR has made fun of every one. *(Interruptions)* ... *(Interruptions)* ...

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दिल्ली) : एक्शन टेकन रिपोर्ट का कोई मतलब ही नहीं है ..... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is over.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh): It is an insult to the House.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार) : आपको याद होगा माननीय मंत्री जी ने कहा था कि एक ऐसा दस्तावेज आएगा जिसको पढ़कर आप याद करेंगे....(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now. let us go ahead with the Legislative Business.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT): The re-revised ATR is not the basic question. But the basic question is ... *(Interruptions)* ... by the JPC. That is the basic question.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One second, please.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, they have made fun of us, fun of Parliament. It is a disgraceful act ... *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will listen to you. Biplab Dasji, please sit down. One second, I will allow you. But please let me get some information.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal) : Madam, where is the revised ATR? He has only revised some paragraphs.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: As tho House has been informed, the reply to the clarifications on the statement will be taken up tomorrow.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): Where is the Prime Minister? We want the Prime Min»ter in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN... That is what I am saying. One minute. I am just asking, आप मेरी बात पूरी नहीं सुनते । बैठिए, पहले मेरी बात सुनिए ।

Because tomorrow the reply would be there.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: By whom?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It was discussed in the Chairman's Chamber. The Prime Minister was . . . *(Interruptions).* .. tomorrow.

SHRI E. BALANANDAN (Kerala): We want the Prime Minister to reply today. *(Interruptions).* We want the reply to be given by the Prime Minister today, not **tomorrow. ... *(Interrupions).***

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : Madam, **we want . . . *(Interruptions).***

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): Madam, let me first understand what exactly the hon. Leader of the Opposition would like to convey. *(Interruptions).* Let us hear them **one by one. *(Interruptions).***

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मेरी अर्ज सुन लीजिए । मेरा मुतालबा यह है कि क्लेरिफिकेशन के बाद प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब रिएक्शन जाहिर करने के लिए यहां पर तशरीफ लायें ।

†[شری سکندر بخت : میری عرض سن لیجئے - میرا مطالبہ یہ ہے کہ کلیری فیکیشن کے بعد پرائم منسٹر صاحب ری ایکشن ظاہر کرنے کے لیئے یہاں تشریف لائیں -]

उपसभापति : आयेंगे कल ।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : दूसरी बात भी कह दूं? दूसरी बात यह है कि हाउस में प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब रिएक्शन के बाद शुगर स्कैम का सिलसिला डिसकस करने के लिए क्या तरीका होगा यह बता दें । क्योंकि मेरा मोशन है अंडर 168 । तीसरी बात यह है कि यह जो एटीआर है इट इज मीनिंग-लेस । यह एटीआर रिवाइज्ड जो है, चेयरमन साहब ने जो एक्योरेंस हाउस में दिया था उसके बिल्कुल खिलाफ है । मेरा मुतालबा यह है जेपीसी ने जिन लोगों को गिल्टी पाया है उनको पनिश किया जाए। इन तीनों बातों का जवाब दीजिए ।

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.

†[شری سکندر بخت : دوسری بات یہی کہہ دوں - دوسری بات یہ ہے کہ ہاوس میں پرائم منسٹر صاحب ری ایکشن کے بعد شوگر اسکیم کا سلسلہ ڈسکس کرنے کیلئے کیا طریقہ ہوگا یہ بتا دیں کیونکہ میرا موشن ہے انڈر ۱۶۸ - تیسری بات یہ ہے کہ یہ جو اے-ٹی-آر ہے ''اٹ از میننگلیس'' یہ اے-ٹی-آر-ریوائزڈ جو ہے - چیئرمین صاحب نے جو اینشورنس ہاوس میں دیا تھا اسکے بلکل خلاف ہے - میرا مطالبہ ہے کہ جے-پی-سی نے جن لوگوں کو گلٹی پایا ہے انکو پنش کیا جائے - ان تینوں باتوں کا جواب دیجئے -]

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : Madam, may I . . . ***(Interruptions).***

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, the Home Minister said he would listen to **us one by one. *(Interruptions).***

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI (Madhya Pradesh) : He it on hit legs.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) : Madam, I would like to make my submission. *(Interruptions).* I seek **your indulgence. *(Interruptions).***

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not been able to identify anybody just **now. *(Interruptions).***

SHRI SATYA PRAJCASH MALA-V1YA: Please identify me, Madam.

मेरा अनुरोध है पहले सब की बात सुन लें उसके बाद होम मिनिस्टर साहब जवाब दें । क्योंकि सिकन्दर बख्त साहब ने कई चीजें मिला दी हैं—एटीआर, शुगर और क्लेरिफिकेशन सब मिला दिया । (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Guru-ilu-sji, one minute. *(Interruptions).* What are we discusting now?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Let me make my submission.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Home Minister wanted to listen to all of us one by one. He is a very confused man. ***[Interruptions).***

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am getting **confused now . . . *(Interruptions)* . .**

t[ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.

with so many people speaking at. the same time.

SHR1 GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, let me make my submission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : On whai?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Let me make my submission on this point, on what Mr. Sikander Bakht said and on what the Home Minister is reacting to. Let him listen to us also and then react.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : I wanted to bear the Leader of the Opposition.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Mr. Chavan, please listen to us. *(Interruptions).* Madam, he has yielded.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has yielded not to you. I am sorry. The leader of the House has courtesy for the Chair. He has yitlded to me because I want to say something. Mr. Chavan is not going away from the House. He is sitting here. He is the Leader of the House. Mr. Sikander Bakht raised an issue and he wants to answer. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I also want to raise a point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He will answer.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let him answer us together.

i HE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is not what we should decide. *(Interruptions).* Please listen. Please sit down, Mr. Nara-yaaasamy. There is no need to get angry. Please listen. Have some patience. Keep quiet, please, *(Interruptions).* Please listen to me, all of you. No cross-talk, please. If the Leader of the House wants to respond to the Leader of the Opposition, I will allow him. It is not for me to decide .. . *(Interruptions).* I will allow you also. If he wants to answer him, how can you stop him?

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : On the points which the hon. Leader of the Opposition has raised, I cannot, possibly, refer to what happened in the Chamber of the Chairman. But, at the same time, he is aware of the fact that the Prime Minister has been specially requested that he should come here and instead of Mr. Chaturvedi replying, it will be better if the Prime Minister himself were to come and reply. And he has agreed to come tomorrow. In that way, I think it will be better if we allow the other business to go on. Now, the second point, which the Leader of the Opposition has raised, is about having a full-fledged discussion under Rule 168. The Chairman was pleased to write to me and also to the Prime Minister. I have sent my reply and the Prime Minister must have sent the reply by now. So the position is absolutely clear that we are not going to discuss this under Rule 168. But if they want to have a Short Duration Discussion or some other discussion, that we can have and by all means, they are free to express their views.

About the other issues, so far as the agenda items are concerned, there is no other item than clarifications on the statement regarding Gian Prakash Committee Report and as soon as this item is over, you will find a Statutory Resolution and the Legislative Business in the List of Business. So, the question of ATR and other things does not arise because it is not listed at all for discussion today. Madam, that point about the ATR will not arise and when it is listed in the List of Business, certainly, they are free to ex-pi ess their views. In the mean time, let us finish at least one item of the Government Business because during the whole Session, we have not done even one item. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALA-VIYA : We have passed one bill *(Interruptions).*

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : Somebody is mismanaging the legislative business... *(tnterruptios).*

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : Let me first complete what T have to submit to the hon. Deputy Chairperson.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please let him finish. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : Since the reply about the clarification is not today… *(In-*

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार) : अगर अलीबाबा के दोस्तों को केबिनेट में रखा जाएगा तो हाउस कैसे चलेगा ।... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : Whatever agenda has been circulated, thereafter, only the Government Bills have been shown in the List of Business. So, my request will be, at least, we should try to complete one itsm of the Government Business during this Session. *(Interruptions).*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि ... (व्यवधान) ... ज्ञान प्रकाश कमेटी की रिपोर्ट... (व्यवधान) ... की

लेजिस्लेशन बिजनेस है, यह गवर्नमेंट की जिम्मेदारी है, इसकी जिम्मेदारी अपोजीशन पर नहीं है।... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, so many Members have raised their hands. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, Mr. S. Jaipal Reddy and so on. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I seek your indulgence. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We can go ahead one by one. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, let me start. Jaipal Ji, she has identified me. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mathur li. you press the button and I will allow you. All the names are here. So, first Gurudas Das Gupta will speak and then Mr. Jaipal Reddy. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, everyday, they are running away. *(Interruptions).* They are cheating themselves. They do not have any points. *(Interruptions).* That is ;,!1 *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Gurudas Das Gupta speak. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Madam, they are not allowing the business to run. *(Interruptions).* Let us !;<ke up the Bill. *(Interruptions).*

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : कल आपने सदन की कार्यवाही स्थगित कर दी थी (व्यवधान) मैं जानकारी चाहता हूं जो कुछ उन्होंने पढ़ा वह रिकार्ड पर है या नहीं (व्यवधान) एक्सपंज किया जाए (व्यवधान) उसके बारे में पोजीशन क्या है ? (व्यवधान)

TE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look into the record.. .*(Interruptions)*.... I will look into the record. It is something different ..*(Interruptions)*.. It is something different . . . *(Interruptions)* .. .

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN : Madam, we want to know the truth.... *(Interrupts*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will look into the record. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : Madam, we want a reply from the Prime Minister on the sugar *caadal.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu) : We want the Prime Minister. He should come to House ... *(Interruptions).*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : The guilty must be punished, Madam.

उपसभापति महोदया, जब तक दोषी लोगों को सजा नहीं होगी तब तक सदन चलाने का कोई अर्थ नहीं है (व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Let ths Bill be passed . .. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : Let the Prime Minister come and reply. . . *(Interruptions)* ... We want the Prime Minister should come to the House and reply. *(Interruptions).*

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : जब तक कार्यवाही नहीं की जाएगी ... (व्यवधान)

डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशी : संसद को इस तरह से अपमानित नहीं किया जा सकता (व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : कोई कार्य करने का अधिकार नहीं है (व्यवधान)

श्री जनार्दन यादव : इस तरह से देश में भ्रष्टाचार बढ़ता जाएगा (व्यवधान) भ्रष्टाचार अधिक होता जा रहा है (व्यवधान)

डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशी : जब तक भ्रष्ट मंत्रियों के खिलाफ कार्यवाही नहीं होती (व्यवधान) जे०पी० सी० रिपोर्ट के अनुसार कार्यवाही नहीं होती तब तक संसद को चलाने का आपको कोई हक नहीं है (व्यवधान) जब तक आप भ्रष्ट मंत्रियों के विरुद्ध कार्यवाही नहीं करेंगे, भ्रष्ट अधिकारियों के विरुद्ध कार्यवाही नहीं करेंगे तब तक इस भ्रष्ट सरकार को (व्यवधान)

SHRI E. BALANANDAN: Lei the Prime Minister come. We want the Prime Minister .. . *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. NARAYANSAMY: Madam, as desired by the Leader of the House, let us discuss the Bill first and then take up other issues . . . *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You are •aying something. Somebody else is saying something else. I am laughing at the difference. I know that .. . *(Interruptions).* Everyone wants to speak . . . *(Interruptions)* ... Let us go to the listed Business. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI E. BALANANDAN: Let the Prime Minister come to the House aad react on the sugar scandal. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, the guilty Minister should be punished.

श्री सैयद सिब्ते रजी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : जब भी ए०टी०आर० का मामला सदन में आता है तो अपोजीशन के लोग ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: The Prime Minister should reply, that is the only demand. .. *(Interruptions)* ... We want **the** Prime Minister. *(Interruptions)*

SHR S. K. T. RAMACHANADRAN : On the whole it is purely Zero Hour. Nothing is transacted ... *(Interruptions)* ... They are running away from legislation.

They are running away from making legislations. They don't want to discuss the Bills. ... *(Interruptions)* ... What is this, Madam ? *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHARMAN : What is the use of sitting here ? *(Interruptions)* . . . I am standing up, closing my ears : *(Interruptions)* ... I shall adjourn the House . . . *(Interruptions)* ... I adjourn the House till one of the clock.

The House then adjourned at thirty-one minute past tweleve of the clock.

1.00 P.M.

The House reassembled at one minute past one of the clock, The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam... *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Madam,.. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam ... *(Interruptions).*

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALA-V1YA : Madam . . . *(Interruptions).*

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, I request you to give me one minute. *(Interruptions).* The listed business is there .. . *(Interruptions).*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam,. . *(Interruptions).*

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, as they arc not interested in seeking clarifications, I request you to take up the other items on the agenda. Many days hava already been wasted and no business has been taken up. *(Interruptions).* There are certain Ordinances **...** *(Interruptions).*

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALA-VIYA: Two weeks have been wasted. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, .. . *(Interruptions).*

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Madam, . .. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam.. . . *(Interruptions).*

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, there is financial business also. *(Interruptions).* If the financial business is not taken up, I .\m sorry to say that the House ... *(Interruptions).* The listed busines should be taken up forthwith. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Madam, . . . *(Interruptions).*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : Madam, .. . *(Interruptions).*

श्री जनार्दन यादव (बिहार) : ए०टी०आर० के दोषी मंत्रियों को बाहर निकाला जाए ।... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Can 1 say something ? *(Interruptions).* There are two opinions. If you want to ta'-k about sugar and ATR, they have their viewpoint about the Government business. I think there is no solution in it. So, what is the point in just straining the throats and minds ? I think there is no point in sitting over here. ... *(Interruptions)* .. . unless we come to some agreement. *(Interruptions).* Let us not *(Interruptions).* The listed Government business is there. It has to be passed. I don't find any agreement or arrangement or method by which we can come to a solution. *(Interruptions).* So, what is the point in just sitting over here? *(Interruptions).* I think I should adjourn the House for the day. *(Interruptions).*

The House is adjourned till 11.00 a.m. tomorrow.

The House then adjourned at four minutes past one of the clock till eleven of the clock on Thursday, the 22nd December, 1994.

GM-GIPN-S.-4-43 RSS/ND/96-15-5-98- 400.